

# STRATOSPHERIC PROCESSES AND THEIR ROLE IN CLIMATE SPARC

A project of the WMO/ICSU/IOC World Climate Research Programme

---

## SPARC Report on the Evaluation of Chemistry-Climate Models

June 2010

Prepared by the SPARC Chemistry-Climate Model Validation Activity Group  
under the auspices of the SPARC Scientific Steering Group

Edited by V. Eyring, T. G. Shepherd and D. W. Waugh

WCRP - 132  
WMO/TD - No. 1526  
SPARC Report No. 5

Editing: Diane Pendlebury

Design and Layout: Diane Pendlebury and Victoria De Luca

Citation, SPARC CCMVal (2010):

SPARC CCMVal (2010), SPARC Report on the Evaluation of Chemistry-Climate Models, V. Eyring, T. G. Shepherd, D. W. Waugh (Eds.), SPARC Report No. 5, WCRP-132, WMO/TD-No. 1526.

Available at <http://www.atmosp.physics.utoronto.ca/SPARC>

We acknowledge the British Atmospheric Data Centre (BADC) for collecting and archiving the CCMVal model output, which is available in the CCMVal-2 project directory at the BADC.

# Contents

---

|  |              |
|--|--------------|
| <b>List of Figures</b>   | <b>xi</b>    |
| <b>List of Tables</b>  | <b>xxiii</b> |
| <b>Lists of Authors, Reviewers and Modelling Groups</b>  | <b>xxvii</b> |
| <b>Executive Summary</b>   | <b>xxxI</b>  |
| Preface .....  | xxxi         |
| Overall Key Findings .....   | xxxiI        |
| Overall Recommendations .....  | xxxiII       |
| Key Findings by Chapter .....  | xxxiIV       |
| Recommendations by Chapter .....   | xl           |
| <b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>   | <b>1</b>     |
| 1.1 Rationale .....  | 1            |
| 1.2 CCMVal concept for model evaluation and analysis .....   | 3            |
| 1.3 Quantitative performance metrics.....  | 4            |
| 1.4 Progress beyond the state-of-the-art.....  | 8            |
| 1.5 Report Structure .....   | 9            |
| References .....   | 10           |
| <b>Chapter 2: Chemistry Climate Models and Scenarios</b>   | <b>17</b>    |
| 2.1 Introduction.....  | 18           |
| 2.2 Climate change in CCMVal-2.....  | 18           |
| 2.3 Major components of chemistry climate models and their coupling by transport and radiation ..... | 19           |
| 2.3.1 Dynamics .....   | 19           |
| 2.3.1.1 Dynamical cores and model grids.....   | 19           |
| 2.3.1.2 Horizontal diffusion .....   | 23           |
| 2.3.1.3 The Quasi-Biennial Oscillation.....  | 24           |
| 2.3.1.4 Gravity wave drag .....  | 25           |
| 2.3.2 Radiation.....   | 27           |
| 2.3.3 Chemistry and composition .....  | 27           |
| 2.3.3.1 Stratospheric chemistry .....  | 27           |
| 2.3.3.2 Tropospheric chemistry.....  | 27           |
| 2.3.3.3 Mesospheric and upper atmospheric chemistry and physics .....                                | 30           |

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 2.3.3.4 Time-integration of chemical kinetics .....   | 30 |
| 2.3.3.5 Photolysis.....   | 31 |
| 2.3.3.6 Heterogeneous reactions and PSC microphysics .....                                    | 31 |
| 2.3.3.7 Boundary conditions, emissions and surface sinks .....                                | 33 |
| 2.3.4 Transport.....  | 35 |
| 2.3.4.1 Advection .....   | 35 |
| 2.3.4.2 Convective transport and turbulent mixing of chemical species .....                   | 37 |
| 2.4 CCMVal-2 models and development since CCMVal-1 .....                                      | 37 |
| 2.4.1 AMTRAC3 (known as AMTRAC in CCMVal-1) .....   | 37 |
| 2.4.2 CAM3.5.....   | 39 |
| 2.4.3 CCSRNIES .....  | 39 |
| 2.4.4 CMAM.....   | 40 |
| 2.4.5 CNRM-ACM .....  | 40 |
| 2.4.6 E39CA (known as E39C in CCMVal-1).....  | 40 |
| 2.4.7 EMAC .....  | 41 |
| 2.4.8 GEOSCCM .....   | 41 |
| 2.4.9 LMDZrepro.....  | 41 |
| 2.4.10 MRI .....  | 41 |
| 2.4.11 SOCOL and NiwaSOCOL .....  | 41 |
| 2.4.12 ULAQ.....  | 42 |
| 2.4.13 UMETRAC .....  | 42 |
| 2.4.14 UMSLIMCAT .....  | 42 |
| 2.4.15 UMUKCA-METO and UMUKCA-UCAM .....  | 42 |
| 2.4.16 WACCM .....  | 43 |
| 2.5 Definitions of simulations and external forcings .....                                    | 43 |
| 2.5.1 Internal and external modelling uncertainties .....                                     | 45 |
| 2.5.2 CCMVal-2 simulations .....  | 45 |
| 2.5.2.1. REF-B0: Year 2000 time-slice simulation .....  | 45 |
| 2.5.2.2. REF-B1: Reproducing the past.....  | 45 |
| 2.5.2.3. REF-B2: Making Predictions.....  | 46 |
| 2.5.3 External forcings .....   | 47 |
| 2.5.3.1 SSTs and sea ice .....  | 47 |
| 2.5.3.2 Long-lived greenhouse gases and ozone-depleting substances.....                       | 47 |
| 2.5.3.3 Ozone precursors .....  | 48 |
| 2.5.3.4 Stratospheric aerosol surface area densities and direct aerosol-related heating ..... | 48 |
| 2.5.3.5 QBO time series.....  | 50 |
| 2.5.3.6 Solar irradiance .....  | 50 |
| 2.5.4 Deviations from simulation definitions .....  | 50 |
| 2.6 Diagnostic output requested for CCMVal-2 .....  | 55 |
| Acknowledgements .....  | 56 |
| References .....  | 56 |

---

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>Chapter 3: Radiation</b>  | <b>71</b>  |
| 3.1 Introduction .....   | 72         |
| 3.1.1 Radiative based diagnostics .....                            | 72         |
| 3.2 Radiative Transfer Parameterisation .....                      | 72         |
| 3.3 Global mean temperature and temperature trends in CCMs.....    | 75         |
| 3.3.1 Global mean temperature climatology .....                    | 75         |
| 3.3.2 Global mean temperature trends: Past.....                    | 78         |
| 3.3.3 Global mean temperature trends: Future.....                  | 80         |
| 3.4 Evaluation of the CCM radiation codes performance .....        | 81         |
| 3.4.1 Experimental set-up.....                                     | 82         |
| 3.4.2 Fluxes: Control experiment.....                              | 83         |
| 3.4.3 Fluxes: Sensitivity experiments .....                        | 85         |
| 3.4.4 Heating/Cooling rates: Control experiment.....               | 89         |
| 3.4.5 Heating/Cooling rates: Sensitivity experiments .....         | 93         |
| 3.4.6 Radiation scheme errors and model temperature biases .....   | 96         |
| 3.5 Solar signal in CCMs .....                                     | 97         |
| 3.5.1 Experimental Setup .....                                     | 98         |
| 3.5.2 Sensitivity of the solar signal to spectral resolution ..... | 98         |
| 3.6 Summary .....  | 100        |
| 3.6.1 Summary by model.....  | 102        |
| 3.6.2 Overall summary.....   | 106        |
| References .....   | 106        |
| <b>Chapter 4: Stratospheric Dynamics</b>                           | <b>109</b> |
| 4.1 Introduction .....   | 109        |
| 4.2 Evaluation data sets and analyses .....                        | 112        |
| 4.3 Mean climatology.....  | 113        |
| 4.3.1 Zonal-mean temperatures and eastward wind .....              | 113        |
| 4.3.2 Stationary waves / zonal asymmetries .....                   | 116        |
| 4.3.3 Brewer-Dobson circulation / tropical upwelling .....         | 119        |
| 4.3.4 Heat flux / heat flux-temperature correlations.....          | 124        |
| 4.3.5 Polar stratospheric cloud threshold temperatures .....       | 126        |
| 4.4 Variability .....  | 129        |
| 4.4.1 Extra-tropical variability of the zonal-mean zonal wind..... | 129        |
| 4.4.2 Tropical variability of the zonal-mean zonal wind .....      | 132        |
| 4.4.3 Frequency of major stratospheric sudden warmings .....       | 134        |
| 4.4.4 Timing of final warmings / winter-summer transition.....     | 136        |
| 4.5 Conclusions .....  | 138        |
| 4.5.1 Multi-model summary .....                                    | 138        |
| 4.5.2 Summary by model.....  | 139        |
| 4.5.3 Quantitative assessment / metrics.....                       | 142        |
| 4.5.4 Future projections .....                                     | 144        |
| Acknowledgements .....   | 144        |

---

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| References .....   | 144        |
| <b>Chapter 5: Transport</b>  | <b>149</b> |
| 5.1 Introduction .....   | 149        |
| 5.2 Transport Diagnostics for the Tropics .....                          | 150        |
| 5.2.1 Ascent .....   | 151        |
| 5.2.1.1 Tape Recorder Phase Speed.....                                   | 151        |
| 5.2.1.2 Ascent from Mean Age Gradients .....                             | 155        |
| 5.2.1.3 Comparison of Vertical Velocities .....                          | 157        |
| 5.2.2. Tropical-Mid-latitude Mixing .....                                | 159        |
| 5.2.2.1 Tape Recorder Amplitude.....                                     | 159        |
| 5.2.2.2 Tropical CH <sub>4</sub> Vertical Gradient .....                 | 160        |
| 5.2.2.3 Tropical Mean Age .....  | 162        |
| 5.2.2.4 Tropical-Midlatitude N <sub>2</sub> O PDFs .....                 | 163        |
| 5.3 Transport Diagnostics for the Extra-tropics .....                    | 165        |
| 5.3.1 Integrated processes affecting extra-tropical composition.....     | 166        |
| 5.3.1.1 Mid-latitude Mean Age .....                                      | 166        |
| 5.3.1.2 Fractional Release of Cl <sub>y</sub> .....                      | 166        |
| 5.3.1.3 Northern mid-latitude Cl <sub>y</sub> time series .....          | 167        |
| 5.3.1.4 N <sub>2</sub> O annual cycle in the LS .....                    | 169        |
| 5.3.1.5 Mean age at 60°N/S .....   | 169        |
| 5.3.2 Polar processes .....  | 172        |
| 5.3.2.1 Antarctic Spring CH <sub>4</sub> PDFs .....                      | 172        |
| 5.3.2.2 Antarctic September N <sub>2</sub> O profiles .....              | 174        |
| 5.3.2.3 Antarctic spring Cl <sub>y</sub> time series .....               | 175        |
| 5.4 Stratospheric transport changes in the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century..... | 176        |
| 5.5 Summary .....  | 177        |
| 5.5.1 Transport Summaries by Model.....                                  | 177        |
| 5.5.2 Overall CCMVal-2 Model Transport Summary.....                      | 184        |
| 5.5.3 Summary of 21 <sup>st</sup> century transport changes .....        | 187        |
| 5.5.4 Comparison to CCMVal-1 model transport.....                        | 187        |
| 5.5.5 Requirements for transport credibility .....                       | 188        |
| References .....   | 188        |
| <b>Chapter 6: Stratospheric Chemistry</b>                                | <b>191</b> |
| 6.1 Introduction .....   | 192        |
| 6.2 Formulation of Chemical Schemes.....                                 | 192        |
| 6.3 Evaluation of CCMs .....   | 192        |
| 6.3.1 Evaluation of Photolysis Rates .....                               | 194        |
| 6.3.1.1 Introduction to PhotoComp .....                                  | 194        |
| 6.3.1.2 PhotoComp 2008 experiments .....                                 | 195        |
| 6.3.1.3 PhotoComp 2008 results and discussion .....                      | 197        |
| 6.3.1.4 PhotoComp 2008 grading.....                                      | 202        |

---

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 6.3.2 Evaluation of Radical (Fast) Chemistry (Non Polar Region).....             | 202        |
| 6.3.2.1 Background to photochemical steady state model comparisons .....         | 203        |
| 6.3.2.2 Photochemical steady state model results .....                           | 205        |
| 6.3.3 Evaluation of Reservoir and Long- Lived Chemistry.....                     | 213        |
| 6.3.3.1 Tracer-tracer correlations.....  | 213        |
| 6.3.3.2 Comparison with satellite climatologies .....                            | 217        |
| 6.3.3.3 Long-term variations .....   | 218        |
| 6.3.4 Evaluation of Polar Chemistry .....  | 227        |
| 6.3.4.1 Evolution of gas-phase HNO <sub>3</sub> , H <sub>2</sub> O, and HCl..... | 227        |
| 6.3.4.2 Surface area density of PSCs.....  | 231        |
| 6.3.4.3 Chemical ozone depletion in the polar vortices .....                     | 233        |
| 6.3.4.4.1 Meteorological conditions in the polar vortex.....                     | 238        |
| 6.3.4.4.2 Evolution of Chemical Ozone Loss in the Polar Vortex .....             | 239        |
| 6.3.4.4.3. Polar Chemical Ozone Depletion vs. PACl and ClO <sub>x</sub> .....    | 242        |
| 6.4 Summary .....  | 243        |
| 6.4.1 Summary by model.....  | 243        |
| 6.4.2 Overall Summary .....  | 247        |
| References .....   | 247        |
| <b>Chapter 7: Upper Troposphere and Lower Stratosphere</b>                       | <b>253</b> |
| 7.1 Introduction .....   | 253        |
| 7.2 Description of observational data sets used for CCM validation .....         | 254        |
| 7.2.1 Balloon data.....  | 256        |
| 7.2.2 Aircraft data.....   | 256        |
| 7.2.3 Satellite data .....   | 256        |
| 7.2.4 Meteorological Analyses .....  | 258        |
| 7.3 Metrics and Grading .....  | 258        |
| 7.3.1 Grading of Mean and Correlative Quantities .....                           | 258        |
| 7.3.2 Taylor Diagram .....   | 259        |
| 7.4 Results: The Tropical UTLS.....  | 260        |
| 7.4.1 Cold Point Tropopause Temperature .....                                    | 261        |
| 7.4.2 Lapse Rate Tropopause Pressure .....                                       | 262        |
| 7.4.3 Transport in the TTL.....  | 263        |
| 7.4.4 Ozone .....  | 265        |
| 7.4.5 Water Vapour .....   | 266        |
| 7.4.6 Intra-seasonal Variability/ Waves.....                                     | 268        |
| 7.4.7 Vertical Thermal Structure .....   | 271        |
| 7.5 The Extra-tropical UTLS .....  | 273        |
| 7.5.1 Dynamical Structure of the Extra-tropical UTLS .....                       | 274        |
| 7.5.1.1 Zonal mean wind.....   | 274        |
| 7.5.1.2 Mass of the Lowermost Stratosphere .....                                 | 275        |
| 7.5.1.3 Extra-tropical Tropopause pressure.....                                  | 276        |
| 7.5.1.4 Extra-tropical Tropopause Inversion Layer .....                          | 277        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 7.5.2 Transport and mixing .....  | 278        |
| 7.5.2.1 Tracer seasonal cycles in the ‘background’ Lowermost Stratosphere .....                               | 278        |
| 7.5.2.2 Meridional Tracer Gradients .....   | 282        |
| 7.5.2.3 Normalised Vertical Profiles of CO in Tropopause Coordinates .....                                    | 282        |
| 7.5.2.4 Vertical profiles of O <sub>3</sub> , H <sub>2</sub> O and CO relative to the tropopause height ..... | 284        |
| 7.5.2.5. Structure of the ExTL.....   | 286        |
| 7.5.3 Variability in UTLS ozone.....  | 287        |
| 7.6 Trends in the UTLS.....   | 289        |
| 7.6.1 Tropical Tropopause Trends .....  | 289        |
| 7.6.2 Extra-tropical Tropopause Trends.....   | 292        |
| 7.7 Summary and Conclusions.....  | 293        |
| 7.7.1 Quantitative metrics .....  | 293        |
| 7.7.2 Qualitative Diagnostics Discussion.....   | 293        |
| Tropical Diagnostics.....   | 293        |
| Extra-tropical Diagnostics .....  | 294        |
| 7.7.3 Qualitative Model Discussion.....   | 294        |
| 7.7.4 Overall Summary .....   | 296        |
| References .....  | 297        |
| <b>Chapter 8: Natural Variability of Stratospheric Ozone</b>  | <b>305</b> |
| 8.1 Introduction .....  | 306        |
| 8.2 Data and Methodology .....  | 306        |
| 8.2.1 Data .....  | 306        |
| 8.2.2 Multiple Linear Regression Analysis.....  | 308        |
| 8.3 Annual Cycle in Ozone .....   | 309        |
| 8.3.1 Annual cycle at selected locations in the stratosphere .....  | 310        |
| 8.3.2 Springtime ozone values .....   | 312        |
| 8.3.3 Annual cycle metrics .....  | 312        |
| 8.4 Interannual Polar Ozone Variability .....   | 314        |
| 8.4.1 Heat flux and column ozone .....  | 316        |
| 8.4.2 Temperature and column ozone .....  | 318        |
| 8.4.3 Stratospheric annular mode and column ozone .....   | 319        |
| 8.5 Solar Cycle .....   | 321        |
| 8.5.1 Vertical structure of temperature and ozone signal in the tropics .....                                 | 322        |
| 8.5.2 Latitudinal structure of the solar signal in temperature and ozone .....                                | 324        |
| 8.6 QBO in Ozone .....  | 326        |
| 8.6.1 Equatorial Variability and the QBO signal in the stratosphere .....                                     | 326        |
| 8.6.2 QBO signal in column ozone .....  | 329        |
| 8.7 ENSO Signal in Ozone .....  | 330        |
| 8.8 Volcanic Aerosols .....   | 332        |
| 8.8.1 Global mean temperature response .....  | 333        |
| 8.8.2 Vertical temperature response.....  | 334        |
| 8.8.3 Ozone response .....  | 334        |

---

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 8.9 Conclusions .....  | 335        |
| 8.9.1 Summary by process .....   | 336        |
| 8.9.2 Model by model summary.....  | 339        |
| References .....   | 342        |
| <b>Chapter 9: Long-term projections of stratospheric ozone</b>                       | <b>347</b> |
| 9.1 Introduction.....  | 347        |
| 9.2 Analysis methods.....  | 349        |
| 9.2.1 Multi-Model Time Series Analysis .....   | 349        |
| 9.2.2 Multi-linear regression analysis .....   | 349        |
| 9.3 Tropical Ozone .....   | 350        |
| 9.3.1 From the 2006 WMO assessment: .....  | 350        |
| 9.3.2 Further analysis of the CCMVal-1 runs.....                                     | 350        |
| 9.3.3 Tropical TSAM analysis .....   | 351        |
| 9.3.4 Multiple linear regression analysis.....                                       | 354        |
| 9.3.5 The effect of upwelling on ozone .....   | 356        |
| 9.3.6 Brief summary.....   | 356        |
| 9.4 Mid-Latitude Ozone .....   | 356        |
| 9.4.1 From the 2006 WMO assessment: .....  | 356        |
| 9.4.2 Further analysis of the CCMVal-1 runs.....                                     | 356        |
| 9.4.3 Mid-Latitude TSAM analysis .....   | 358        |
| 9.4.4 Multiple linear regression analysis.....                                       | 359        |
| 9.4.5 Brief Summary .....  | 359        |
| 9.5 Polar Ozone.....   | 359        |
| 9.5.1 From the 2006 WMO assessment: .....  | 359        |
| 9.5.2 Further analysis of the CCMVal-1 runs.....                                     | 359        |
| 9.5.3 Polar TSAM analysis .....  | 360        |
| 9.5.4 Antarctic ozone hole diagnostics .....   | 362        |
| 9.5.5 Brief Summary .....  | 365        |
| 9.6 Ozone recovery .....   | 366        |
| 9.6.1 From the 2006 WMO assessment: .....  | 366        |
| 9.6.2 Further analysis of the CCMVal-1 runs.....                                     | 366        |
| 9.6.3 Recovery based on TSAM analysis.....   | 367        |
| 9.6.4 The relationship between O <sub>3</sub> and Cl <sub>y</sub> return dates ..... | 369        |
| 9.6.5 Ozone recovery as a function of latitude and reference year .....              | 370        |
| 9.6.6 The Role of transport in mid-latitude ozone recovery .....                     | 371        |
| 9.6.7 Brief Summary .....  | 372        |
| 9.7 Summary .....  | 373        |
| 9.7.1 Summary by Model.....  | 373        |
| 9.7.2 Overall Summary .....  | 375        |
| References .....   | 375        |

---

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter 10: Effects of the stratosphere on the troposphere</b>                           | <b>379</b> |
| 10.1 Introduction .....   | 379        |
| 10.2 Validation of tropospheric and stratospheric climate .....                             | 382        |
| 10.2.1 Multi-model mean comparison .....  | 383        |
| 10.2.2 CCMVal-2 performance .....   | 385        |
| 10.2.3 CCMVal-2 vs. CCMVal-1.....   | 387        |
| 10.2.4 CCMVal-2 vs. CMIP3.....  | 387        |
| 10.3 Evaluation of Stratosphere-Troposphere Coupling in Models .....                        | 388        |
| 10.3.1 Downward propagation of Annular Mode anomalies .....                                 | 388        |
| 10.3.2 Annular mode time scales and predictability.....                                     | 391        |
| 10.4 Simulations of stratospheric influence on the troposphere in the past and future ..... | 395        |
| 10.4.1 Dynamical effects .....  | 395        |
| 10.4.1.1 Southern Hemisphere .....  | 395        |
| 10.4.1.2 Northern Hemisphere.....   | 398        |
| 10.4.2 Radiative effects .....  | 398        |
| 10.4.2.1 The response of surface UV radiation to stratospheric ozone changes .              | 399        |
| 10.4.2.2 Radiative forcing due to stratospheric ozone changes .....                         | 401        |
| 10.4.3 Chemical effects .....   | 402        |
| 10.4.3.1 Stratosphere-to-troposphere ozone fluxes .....                                     | 402        |
| 10.5 Summary .....  | 405        |
| 10.5.1 Summary by Model.....  | 405        |
| 10.5.2 Overall Summary .....  | 407        |
| References .....  | 408        |
| <b>Appendix A: Major Acronyms and Abbreviations</b>   | <b>413</b> |
| <b>Appendix B: Time Series Additive-Model Analysis</b>                                      | <b>419</b> |
| B.1 Multi-Model Ensemble Analysis .....   | 418        |
| B.2 Nonparametric estimation of the individual model trends .....                           | 419        |
| B.3 Baseline-adjustment of the trend estimates .....  | 420        |
| B.4 Multi-model trend estimates .....   | 421        |
| References .....  | 424        |
| <b>Appendix C: List of WCRP Reports</b>   | <b>425</b> |